



National Defence

Défense nationale

National Defence Headquarters  
Ottawa, Ontario  
K1A 0K2

Quartier général de la Défense nationale  
Ottawa (Ontario)  
K1A 0K2

DRDC | RDDC



# Holistic Professional Formation

Earnscliffe Strategy Group Inc.

Prepared by:  
Earnscliffe Strategy Group Inc.  
46 Elgin Street, Suite 200  
Ottawa, ON K1P 5K6, Canada  
PSPC Contract Number: W7714-176253/001/CY

Technical Authority: **Krystal K. Hachey**  
Contractor's date of publication: **March 2018**

**Terms of Release:** This document is approved for further distribution done by approval from Author or equivalent Authority. Further distribution of this document or information contained herein is prohibited without the written approval of Defence Research and Development Canada (DRDC).

**Defence Research and Development Canada**

**Contract Report**  
**DRDC-RDDC-2018-C062**  
**March 2018**

**Canada** 

## IMPORTANT INFORMATIVE STATEMENTS

**Disclaimer:** This document is not published by the Editorial Office of Defence Research and Development Canada, an agency of the Department of National Defence of Canada, but is to be catalogued in the Canadian Defence Information System (CANDIS), the national repository for Defence S&T documents. Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada (Department of National Defence) makes no representations or warranties, expressed or implied, of any kind whatsoever, and assumes no liability for the accuracy, reliability, completeness, currency or usefulness of any information, product, process or material included in this document. Nothing in this document should be interpreted as an endorsement for the specific use of any tool, technique or process examined in it. Any reliance on, or use of, any information, product, process or material included in this document is at the sole risk of the person so using it or relying on it. Canada does not assume any liability in respect of any damages or losses arising out of or in connection with the use of, or reliance on, any information, product, process or material included in this document.

This document was reviewed for Controlled Goods by Defence Research and Development Canada (DRDC) using the Schedule to the *Defence Production Act*.

**Endorsement statement:** This publication has been peer-reviewed and published by the Editorial Office of Defence Research and Development Canada, an agency of the Department of National Defence of Canada. Inquiries can be sent to: [Publications.DRDC-RDDC@drdc-rddc.gc.ca](mailto:Publications.DRDC-RDDC@drdc-rddc.gc.ca).

Template in use: (2012) CR EL1 Advanced Template\_EN 2017-11\_02-V01\_WW.dotm

- © Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada (Department of National Defence), 2018
- © Sa Majesté la Reine en droit du Canada (Ministère de la Défense nationale), 2018

## HOLISTIC PROFESSIONAL FORMATION: CONTRACT REPORT

Earnscliffe is pleased to present this report to the Department of National Defence summarizing the results of the qualitative research study to expand knowledge of the role of holistic learning at the Canadian Forces College (CFC).

As per section 10.2.3 of Standards for the Conduct of Government of Canada Public Opinion Research—Qualitative Research (<https://www.tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca/rop-por/rechqual-qualres-eng.html#s10.2>), it is important to note that qualitative research is a form of scientific, social, policy and public opinion research. Focus group research is not designed to help a group reach a consensus or to make decisions, but rather to elicit the full range of ideas, attitudes, experiences and opinions of a selected sample of participants on a defined topic. Because of the small numbers involved, the participants are not representative in a statistical sense of the larger population from which they are drawn and findings cannot reliably be generalized beyond their number.

Research Firm: Earnscliffe Strategy Group Inc. (Earnscliffe)  
Contract Number: W7714-176253/001/CY  
Contract award date: February 16, 2017  
Total contract value: \$40,081.10

I hereby certify as a Representative of Earnscliffe Strategy Group that the final deliverables fully comply with the Government of Canada political neutrality requirements outlined in the Communications Policy of the Government of Canada and Procedures for Planning and Contracting Public Opinion Research. Specifically, the deliverables do not include information on electoral voting intentions, political party preferences, standings with the electorate or ratings of the performance of a political party or its leaders.

Signed:

Date: March 4, 2018



Doug Anderson  
Principal, Earnscliffe  
46 Elgin St #200,  
Ottawa, ON K1P 5K6



Earnscliffe

POR #: 113-16



## Holistic Professional Formation Contract Report

Prepared for: Department of National Defence

Contract Number: W7714-176253/001/CY

Contract Award Date: February 16, 2017

Date of Delivery: March 4, 2018

Contact Information: [POR-ROP@forces.gc.ca](mailto:POR-ROP@forces.gc.ca)

*Ce rapport est aussi disponible en français.*

## CONTENTS

CONTENTS.....	2
LIST OF FIGURES .....	3
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY .....	4
SOMMAIRE .....	8
INTRODUCTION .....	12
RESULTS .....	14
KEY FINDINGS AND OBSERVATIONS.....	14
PERCEIVED HIERARCHY OF VALUE OF HIDDEN LEARNING ACTIVITES .....	16
ADDITIONAL FINDINGS .....	29
CONCLUSIONS .....	32
REFERENCES .....	33
APPENDIX A: INVITATION .....	34
APPENDIX B: CONSENT FORM.....	35
APPENDIX C: QUALITATIVE DISCUSSION GUIDE .....	37
APPENDIX D: HANDOUT.....	41

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Experiential Learning Visits (ELVs) .....	14
Figure 2: Casual, informal or spontaneous interactions you had with colleagues, staff or faculty .....	15
Figure 3: Coffee and tea breaks and/or meals in the mess hall.....	16
Figure 4: Organized sports (i.e., hockey, rugby, soccer, etc.) .....	17
Figure 5: TGIT .....	18
Figure 6: Lunch 'n' Learns .....	19
Figure 7: Social clubs (i.e., scotch club, wine tasting club, running club, yoga club, etc.) .....	20
Figure 8: Special events and outings (i.e., sporting events, family events, etc.) .....	20
Figure 9: Digital/Online tools (i.e., Facebook group, applications, etc.) .....	21
Figure 10: Conferences .....	23
Figure 11: Outreach/Volunteer Activities .....	24
Figure 12: Group Weekend Travel ("Road Runner" Groups) .....	25

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

### Background

Currently, there is little information available regarding holistic learning that takes place during the time that senior officers in the Canadian Armed Forces (CAF) spend attending the Joint Command and Staff Programme (JCSP) and the National Security Programme (NSP) at the CFC. This research uses the comprehensive model of holistic learning developed by Eren, Butler and Budgell (2015) to expand the CAF's understanding regarding the role of holistic learning in professional military education (PME) among students in the JCSP and NSP programmes. A qualitative research design was implemented to understand students, faculty, and staff's experiences with the programme, sources of hidden learning, as well as how different types of learning and individual differences associated with each student affect professional learning. The results of this research will be used to (Hachey, 2016):

- develop a model of understanding, designing and delivering on all aspects of learning needed to achieve professional mastery;
- identify how learning is affected by the environmental and organizational context, as well as the sources of hidden learning; and
- inform how types of learning influence learning of the profession.

The specific objectives of the research were to (Eren, Butler, and Budgell, 2015):

1. explore how holistic learning contributes to the PME of CAF members and other participants in both the JCSP and NSP programmes;
2. identify the sources of hidden learning across both programmes and what factors influence depth of analysis;
3. explore how types of learning and depth of learning influence the Four Foci of Holistic Learning, (learning to learn; learning the game; learning to be an expert; and learning the profession) particularly learning of the profession; and
4. explore how individual differences associated with the learner, and the environmental and organizational context in which the learning takes place affect the Four Foci of Holistic Learning.

### Methods

The qualitative research approach involved three separate visits to CFC. The first visit was an observation and information gathering visit involving an initial discussion with faculty and staff (May 10, 2017), and a pilot group with students (May 11, 2017) to ensure the discussion guide elicited the necessary information. The second visit was to conduct the focus groups with JCSP students: the first focus group was conducted with international students (June 8, 2017); the second with Canadian students (June 9, 2017). The third visit was to conduct the discussion groups with NSP students: the first focus group was conducted with CAF students (February 6, 2018); the second with non-CAF students (February 6, 2018) (Hachey, 2016).



Before the start of the focus groups, students were given a consent form to sign. Once the consent forms were received, the facilitators provided an introduction to the concept of hidden learning and explaining the objectives of the research. Students were then given a handout, developed in collaboration with the CFC, listing twelve different activities as well as a space to add more, and were asked to rank each one in terms of how valuable it was to their overall development. When ranking, participants were encouraged to think beyond merely how it contributed to their academic performance and consider whether or how it may have contributed to their professional and personal development writ large. Both the handout and the focus group discussion guide were developed in consultation with the client.

## Results

The key findings from the research are presented below:

1. **Students demonstrate passion for the programme.** The opportunity to provide any sort of feedback was welcomed and discussions were candid and lengthy. The thoughts expressed throughout the discussions were constructive and the tone betrayed a desire to see future student cohorts achieve the same valuable experience these participants had and more.
2. **Hidden learning is prevalent, impactful, and valued.** Based upon the information collected in the group discussions, it is abundantly clear that hidden learning does occur and that it contributes to each student's experience in a positive manner. Most students readily offered several ways in which this occurred, providing CFC and DND with a wealth of information on the kinds of activities that may be contributing the greatest additional learning value.
3. **Hidden learning activities contribute in a unique and complementary fashion.** There are a range of benefits that students perceived from the various hidden learning activities discussed. Encouragingly, these benefits each tended to relate to at least one of the Four Foci of Holistic Learning, suggesting that the activities are contributing to holistic learning.
4. **Students tailor hidden learning programming to suit their unique needs.** While hidden learning opportunities are valued by all and some specific activities are commonly identified as particularly valuable, some activities find niche segments of students benefitting more than others. Not surprisingly, these preferences are heavily influenced by each student's personal living situation (i.e., whether the student lives in residence, is a weekend road-runner, or living with family off residence). The conclusion to be drawn is that "one size does not fit all" when it comes to the optimal combination of hidden learning activities.
5. **International students are a unique and vital segment of the student population.** The discussions among Canadian students made it abundantly clear there is widespread value for the hidden learnings that come from getting to know their international counterparts more personally and developing an understanding of the range of perspectives across different national forces. International students, therefore, have both a direct relationship to their own programme experience and an indirect relationship to the interchanges that Canadian students value.
6. **International students had their own unique experience with hidden learning.** While some of the findings relating to the unique circumstances of international students revolved around the challenge



of succeeding in the programme, especially for those trying to keep pace with the readings in a language that is not their own, there are three aspects that arose that do relate to hidden learning experiences:

- An informal support group of “international wives” had a dual benefit to the international students of both improving the experience for their families and enabling the international students to devote more time and energy to the programme, including to participating in hidden learning activities.
  - The pre-programme orientation period enabled valuable networks to begin to form and unique bonds to be developed among the international students.
  - Sponsors appear to be an underutilized resource that students expect could enable unique hidden learning opportunities or allow the student to devote more time and energy to the programme.
7. On the whole, JCSP and NSP students both tended to demonstrate that hidden learning activities are providing them benefits and many of the activities identified as impactful were common to students of both programmes, the specifics sometimes varied based upon circumstances unique to each programme. For example, students of both programmes clearly felt the Experiential Learning Visits (ELVs) were among the most beneficial of the hidden learning activities. While discussions showed that the unique ELV experiences each programme offers necessarily taught different things, the same discussions also demonstrated some valuable hidden learning opportunities that ELVs have in common across both programmes. Namely, the fact that students are forced to spend extended amounts of time in each other’s company has a tendency to open up new opportunities for getting to know each other and exchange insights.
8. JCSP students had additional, unique hidden learning experiences. More specific to JCSP students, in discussing the experiences relating to the various forms of hidden learnings – whether from the prompted list or those activities that students mentioned on an unprompted basis – some common elements (across both groups of JCSP students) emerged that tend to lead to more valuable hidden learning experiences:
- the ability to experience things first-hand for themselves – whether trades, equipment or traditions;
  - the ability to engage peers in their own trade, peers in other trades, and peers with different international perspectives, allowing conversation to go wherever it is of greatest interest and value; and,
  - the ability to form trusting relationships and safe environments in which to hold candid and frank discussions – with students, academics, Defence Scientists, experts or others – that may or may not relate to the curriculum.
9. Similarly, NSP students identified some hidden learning experience more exclusively found with that programme. Although there were many perspectives held in common across both programmes, there were a few findings emerged that were unique to NSP students:

- CAF NSP students, like JCSP students, greatly appreciated the networking opportunity whereas the non-CAF students appreciated meeting new people but had greater difficulty identifying the new acquaintances as likely to be helpful professionally;
- Non-military non-CAF students also noted there were aspects of the experience to which military students more rapidly adjusted and as a result, were more able to reap hidden-learning benefits such as collaborating on digesting readings and even orienting themselves to the processes and features of the campus.

10. Students appear to receive benefits that contribute towards advancement along each of the four foci. However, the contribution from hidden learning activities do not appear to contribute to each foci equally. Almost all hidden learning activities investigated in the research would appear to be contributing to students learning the game, while few appear to directly relate to learning to be an expert.

Total contract value: \$40,081.10

## SOMMAIRE

### Contexte

Actuellement, il existe peu de données disponibles au sujet de l'approche globale de l'apprentissage utilisée quand les officiers supérieurs des Forces armées canadiennes (FAC) participent au Programme de commandement et d'état-major interarmées (PCEMI) et au Programme de sécurité nationale (PSN), au Collège des Forces canadiennes (CFC). Cette étude se base sur le modèle complet de l'approche globale de l'apprentissage élaboré par Eren, Butler et Budgell (2015) et a pour but d'améliorer la compréhension des FAC sur le rôle de la globalité de l'apprentissage dans la formation militaire professionnelle (FMP) des stagiaires du PCEMI et du PSN. Un modèle de recherche qualitative a été mis sur pied pour comprendre les expériences que vivent les stagiaires, le corps enseignant et le personnel relativement au programme, les sources de l'apprentissage informel, de même que les répercussions des différents types d'apprentissages et des différences entre chaque stagiaire sur l'apprentissage professionnel. Les résultats de cette étude seront utilisés pour (Hachey, 2016) :

- créer un modèle de compréhension, concevoir et exécuter tous les aspects de l'apprentissage nécessaires pour atteindre une pleine maîtrise professionnelle;
- découvrir comment l'apprentissage est influencé par les contextes environnemental et organisationnel, en plus des sources d'apprentissage informel;
- montrer comment les types d'apprentissages influent sur l'apprentissage d'une profession.

Les objectifs précis de cette étude étaient les suivants (Eren, Butler et Budgell, 2015) :

5. étudier comment l'approche globale de l'apprentissage contribue à la FMP des membres des FAC et des autres participants du PCEMI et du PSN;
6. déterminer les sources d'apprentissage informel dans les deux programmes et les facteurs qui influencent la profondeur de l'analyse;
7. examiner comment les types d'apprentissages et la profondeur de l'apprentissage influencent les quatre piliers de l'approche globale de l'apprentissage (apprendre à apprendre; apprendre à jouer; apprendre à devenir un expert et apprendre la profession) plus particulièrement apprendre la profession;
8. examiner comment chacune des différences de l'apprenant et les contextes environnemental et organisationnel dans lesquels l'apprentissage a lieu influencent les quatre piliers de l'approche globale de l'apprentissage.

### Méthodologie

L'approche de la recherche qualitative a nécessité trois visites distinctes au CFC. La première avait pour but d'observer et de recueillir de l'information lors d'une première discussion avec la faculté et le personnel (le 10 mai 2017), et un groupe pilote composé de stagiaires (le 11 mai 2017) pour s'assurer que le guide de discussion recueillait l'information nécessaire. La deuxième visite visait à diriger les groupes témoins composés de stagiaires du PCEMI : le premier groupe témoin était composé de stagiaires étrangers (le 8 juin 2017); le deuxième de stagiaires canadiens (le 9 juin 2017). Au cours de la troisième visite, on a supervisé des groupes de discussion avec des stagiaires du PSN : le premier groupe

témoin était composé de stagiaires des FAC (le 6 février 2018); le deuxième de stagiaires non membres des FAC (le 6 février 2018) [Hachey, 2016].

Avant d’amorcer les travaux avec les groupes témoins, les stagiaires ont reçu un formulaire de consentement à signer. Une fois les formulaires de consentement récupérés, les animateurs ont présenté le concept de l’apprentissage informel et ont expliqué les objectifs de l’étude. On a ensuite distribué aux stagiaires un document rédigé en collaboration avec le CFC sur lequel se trouvait une liste de 12 activités, en plus d’un espace libre pour en ajouter d’autres. On a demandé aux stagiaires d’évaluer chacune d’elles quant à leur pertinence en lien avec leur développement global. Ce faisant, les stagiaires étaient encouragés à se questionner sur l’incidence de l’activité sur leur rendement scolaire et à considérer si elle pouvait avoir contribué à leur développement professionnel et personnel dans l’ensemble et si oui, dans quelle mesure. Autant le document que le guide de discussion du groupe témoin ont été rédigés en collaboration avec le client.

## Résultats

Les principales conclusions de cette étude sont présentées ci-dessous :

11. **Les stagiaires sont passionnés par le programme.** Les rétroactions de toutes sortes étaient les bienvenues et les discussions étaient longues et franches. Les pensées exprimées tout au long des discussions étaient constructives et le ton laissait paraître le désir de voir les futures cohortes de stagiaires vivre la même précieuse expérience qu’eux, voire plus.
12. **L’apprentissage informel est répandu, prisé et a beaucoup d’impact.** D’après les informations recueillies dans les discussions de groupe, il est évident que l’apprentissage informel est présent et qu’il contribue de façon positive à l’expérience de chaque stagiaire. La majorité des stagiaires a révélé volontairement les différentes manifestations en ce sens, fournissant du même coup au CFC et au ministère de la Défense nationale (MDN) une mine d’informations sur les types d’activités qui peuvent le plus contribuer à l’apprentissage.
13. **Les activités d’apprentissage informel contribuent à leur façon et sont complémentaires.** Les stagiaires ont révélé avoir perçu beaucoup de bienfaits sur l’éventail d’activités d’apprentissage informel visées par les discussions. De manière encourageante, ces bienfaits ont tous porté sur au moins un des quatre piliers de l’approche globale de l’apprentissage, ce qui suggère que les activités contribuent à l’approche globale de l’apprentissage.
14. **Les stagiaires adaptent les programmes d’apprentissage informel selon leurs besoins particuliers.** Même si les occasions d’apprentissage informel sont prisées par tous et que certaines activités sont couramment reconnues comme étant particulièrement précieuses, certaines apportent plus à un type de stagiaires qu’à un autre. Sans surprise, ces préférences sont fortement influencées par le mode de vie de chaque stagiaire (p. ex., si le stagiaire vit en résidence, s’il retourne chez lui toutes les fins de semaine, ou s’il vit chez ses parents en dehors du campus). La conclusion à tirer est « à chacun sa méthode » quand vient le temps de combiner de façon optimale les activités d’apprentissage informel.
15. **Les stagiaires étrangers forment un groupe unique et fondamental parmi les stagiaires.** D’après les discussions avec les stagiaires canadiens, il est évident qu’il y a un intérêt généralisé pour l’apprentissage informel provenant des relations plus personnelles qu’ils tissent avec leurs

homologues internationaux et de la sensibilisation aux perspectives variées qui sont propres aux diverses forces nationales. Les stagiaires étrangers ont, par conséquent, autant un lien direct avec leur propre expérience du programme qu'un lien indirect avec les échanges valorisés par les stagiaires canadiens.

**16. Les stagiaires étrangers ont vécu leur propre expérience avec l'apprentissage informel.** Alors que certaines conclusions en lien avec la situation unique des stagiaires étrangers tournent autour de la difficulté à réussir le programme, particulièrement pour ceux qui tentent de suivre le rythme des lectures dans une langue qui n'est pas la leur, trois aspects se sont dégagés concernant les expériences d'apprentissage informel :

- Un groupe de soutien informel de « femmes étrangères » a eu un double effet bénéfique sur les stagiaires étrangers en améliorant l'expérience de leur famille et en permettant aux stagiaires de consacrer plus de temps et d'énergie au programme, incluant la participation aux activités d'apprentissage informel.
- La période d'orientation préalable au programme a favorisé la création de réseaux précieux et de liens uniques entre les stagiaires étrangers.
- Le parrainage s'est révélé être une ressource sous-utilisée que les stagiaires ont vue comme pouvant procurer des occasions d'apprentissage informel uniques et leur permettant de consacrer plus de temps et d'énergie au programme.

**17. Dans l'ensemble, les stagiaires du PCEMI et du PSN ont eu tendance à indiquer que les activités d'apprentissage informel leur ont apporté des bienfaits, et que beaucoup des activités jugées percutantes étaient communes aux stagiaires des deux programmes.** Des fois, les détails variaient d'après des situations propres à chaque programme. Par exemple, des stagiaires des deux programmes ont senti clairement que les visites d'apprentissage expérientiel étaient les activités d'apprentissage informel les plus bénéfiques. Alors que les discussions ont révélé que les expériences uniques de visites d'apprentissage expérientiel offertes dans chaque programme ont nécessairement amené à apprendre des notions différentes, ces discussions ont aussi révélé que, par les visites d'apprentissage expérientiel, les deux programmes ont en commun de précieuses occasions d'apprentissage informel. Ainsi, le fait que les stagiaires aient été forcés de passer un temps considérable ensemble leur a donné des occasions pour apprendre à se connaître et pour échanger.

**18. Les stagiaires du PCEMI ont vécu des expériences d'apprentissage informel supplémentaires et uniques.** Plus particulièrement pour les stagiaires du PCEMI, lors des discussions sur les expériences relatives aux diverses formes d'apprentissage informel — qu'elles aient été sur la liste des activités ou qu'elles aient été spontanément mentionnées par un stagiaire — des éléments (communs aux deux groupes de stagiaires du PCEMI) qui tendent à amener des expériences d'apprentissage informel de plus grande valeur ont émergé :

- la possibilité d'expérimenter directement par eux-mêmes — quels que soient le groupe professionnel, l'équipement ou les traditions;
- la capacité d'intéresser des pairs du même groupe professionnel, d'autres groupes professionnels ou avec des perspectives internationales différentes, en laissant la conversation dériver sur des sujets prisés et de grand intérêt;

- la capacité de créer des relations de confiance et un environnement sain dans lequel il est possible de discuter de façon franche et sincère avec des stagiaires, des universitaires, des scientifiques de la Défense, des experts, etc., qui ne sont pas nécessairement rattachés au programme.
19. De même, les stagiaires du PSN ont relevé des expériences d'apprentissage informel surtout dans ce programme. Bien qu'il y ait beaucoup de perspectives en commun dans les deux programmes, quelques constatations ressortent uniquement chez les stagiaires du PSN :
- Les stagiaires des FAC du PSN, comme ceux du PCEMI, ont grandement aimé pouvoir faire du réseautage alors que les stagiaires qui ne sont pas membres des FAC ont préféré rencontrer de nouvelles personnes, mais avaient plus de difficultés à considérer leurs nouvelles connaissances comme des atouts à leur carrière;
  - Les stagiaires qui n'étaient pas militaires ni membres des FAC ont aussi noté qu'il y avait des aspects de l'expérience auxquels les stagiaires militaires se sont plus rapidement adaptés et par le fait même, qui étaient plus en mesure de récolter les bienfaits de l'apprentissage informel, comme une collaboration pour faire des lectures et même s'orienter dans les façons de faire et les caractéristiques du campus.
20. Les stagiaires semblent tirer des bénéfices sur le plan de chacun des quatre piliers. Toutefois, la contribution des activités d'apprentissage informel ne semble pas contribuer à chaque pilier également. Presque toutes les activités d'apprentissage informel examinées dans le cadre de la présente étude semblent aider les stagiaires à apprendre les règles du jeu, alors que peu d'entre elles semblent mener directement sur la voie de l'expertise.

Valeur totale du contrat: 40 081,10 \$



## INTRODUCTION

### Background

Currently, there is little information available regarding holistic learning that takes place during the time that senior officers in the CAF spend attending the JCSP and the NSP at the CFC. This research uses the comprehensive model of holistic learning developed by Eren, Butler and Budgell (2015) to expand the CAF's understanding the role of holistic learning in professional military education (PME) among students in the JCSP and NSP programmes and inform curriculum development.

As described in Eren et al. (2015), the Four Foci of Holistic Learning are:

1. **Learning to learn:** involves acquiring knowledge efficiently and effectively;
2. **Learning the profession:** involves ways of thinking and different sets of practices that are specific to one's profession;
3. **Learning to be an expert:** involves expertise in terms of the tacit knowledge, skills, and profession specific practices; and
4. **Learning the game:** covers a wide range of academic and non-academic skills, which according to Simons (2009) "can be likened to cultural understanding, situational awareness, and emotional intelligence."

Overall, the research was conducted to (Eren et al., 2015):

- Inform the development of an academically rigorous model for understanding, designing and delivering all aspects of learning needed to achieve professional mastery in both JCSP and NSP;
- Identify how learning is affected by the environmental and organizational context, as well as the individual differences associated with the learner;
- Inform how types of learning influence learning of the profession;
- Identify the sources of types of hidden learning across JCSP and NSP; and
- Provide guidance as to how holistic learning contributes to the PME of CAF members in both the JCSP and NSP programmes.

### Methods

Earnscliffe implemented a qualitative research approach, which included organizing three separate visits to CFC. The first visit was an observation and information gathering visit involving an initial discussion with faculty and staff (May 10, 2017), and a pilot group with students (May 11, 2017) to ensure the discussion guide elicited the necessary information. The second visit was to conduct the discussion groups with JCSP students: the first discussion was conducted with international students (June 8, 2017); the second with Canadian students (June 9, 2017). The third visit was to conduct the discussion groups



with NSP students: the first discussion was conducted with CAF students (February 6, 2018); the second with non-CAF students (February 6, 2018) (Hachey, 2016).

All recruiting was undertaken by DND. Volunteers were solicited (Appendix A) by providing all with 1) a group verbal overview of the purpose of the research to ensure all understood the purpose and that this had support from CFC senior leadership; and 2) a subsequent mass email sent to all soliciting volunteers when the specific date/location were determined. Individuals chose whether or not to participate; there was no direct contact to attempt to influence who volunteered. A total of 31 students participated, including 10 Canadian students in the pilot group, as well as 13 international students and 8 Canadian students in the post-pilot groups. The research protocol included an invitation letter (Appendix A), consent form (Appendix B), discussion guide (Appendix C), and handout (Appendix D).

Before any group was undertaken, the project was reviewed and approved by the Social Science Research Reviews Board (SSRRB). The SSRRB approval number is 1648/17F.

Each JCSP focus group contained two facilitators and participants were given the option to participate in the official language of their choice. For the NSP focus groups, only one facilitator was present and the discussions were conducted in English. Before the start of the focus groups, student were given a consent form to sign (Appendix B). Once the consent forms were received, the facilitators provided an introduction to the concept of hidden learning and explaining the objectives of the research. Students were then given a handout (Appendix D), which was developed in conjunction with CFC, listing twelve different activities as well as a space to add more, and were asked to rank each one in terms of how valuable it was to their overall development. When ranking, participants were encouraged to think beyond merely how it contributed to their academic performance and consider whether or how it may have contributed to their professional and personal development writ large. Both the handout and the focus group discussion guide were developed in consultation with the client. Overall, the focus groups questions covered (Eren et al., 2015):

- how holistic learning contributes to the PME of CAF members and other participants in the JCSP programme;
- the sources of hidden learning and what factors influence depth of analysis;
- how types of learning and depth of learning influence the Four Foci of Holistic Learning, particularly learning of the profession; and
- how individual differences associated with the learner, and the environmental and organizational context in which the learning takes place affect the Four Foci of Holistic Learning.

There were a total of four focus groups that ranged from 60 to 90 minutes.

## RESULTS

This qualitative results are divided into three sections. The first section presents key findings and observations. The second section explores the perceived hierarchy of value of hidden learning activities. The final section provides additional findings that were observed or raised in the discussions that warranted mention in this report.

## KEY FINDINGS AND OBSERVATIONS

### Students Demonstrate Passion for the Programme

Participants consistently demonstrated a high degree of passion for the programme. The opportunity to provide any sort of feedback was welcomed and discussions were candid and lengthy. The candour displayed suggests there is a high degree of trust that has been developed among the students.

This point is raised not merely to indicate the positive frame of mind that students had, but that the year of studying together had clearly allowed some bonds to be forged that were not part of the curriculum but rather are, in and of themselves, a demonstration of the impact of hidden learning activities. The bonds were forged primarily through collaborations, assistance provided to each other in times of need, social interactions, and organized activities (i.e., sports).

The thoughts expressed throughout the discussions were constructive and the tone betrayed a desire to see future student cohorts achieve the same valuable experience these participants had and more. In speaking of the hidden learning experiences and how they benefitted from them, there was a sense of comradery within the room as well as towards those future students and few, if any, demonstrated much focus on a competitive desire to rank more highly than fellow students. Instead, it was repeatedly the case that students demonstrated a strong appetite to glean even more out of the programme, rather than use any of the activities discussed purely to achieve greater academic standing.

### Hidden Learning Is Prevalent, Impactful and Valued

Based on the information collected in the group discussions, it is abundantly clear that hidden learning does occur and that it contributes to each student's experience in a positive manner.

There was not a single participant who failed to demonstrate at least one element of hidden learning that further enabled their success and the value they received from the experience as a whole. Indeed, most students readily offered several ways in which this occurred, providing DND with a wealth of information on the kinds of activities that may be contributing the greatest additional learning value.

Before detailing the specific findings, it is worth noting that, as with any research participant who is asked to express their perceptions, it is almost inevitable that individuals are unable to perfectly portray the actual impacts or benefits. For example, one of the Four Foci of Holistic Learning is learning the game. Comments raised in the discussion demonstrated that students had certainly undertaken some

learning of the game, but may not be conscious that it was an aspect of the learning nor perhaps able to tie personal and professional developments they have experienced to a heightened learning of the game. Further, although the sample is quite small, discussions suggested that the non-military participants in the NSP program may not be “learning the game” at all, or at least in the way that the military participants appear to be learning. It begs the question as to whether “the game” is the same for military and non-military participants alike.

While this report focuses on summarizing the explicit indications of hidden learnings, it will from time to time, provide observational comment as to the implicit indications of hidden learning.

## Students Tailor Hidden Learning Programming to Suit Their Unique Needs

By design, the universe of students in each programme is diverse. While there is an easy ability to categorically sort students into different types based upon obvious characteristics such as Canadians and international students, military and non-military, the different services, residency, rank and gender, there are less obvious segmentation based upon characteristics such as personality and learning types.

One overarching finding that has emerged is that while hidden learning opportunities are valued by all and some specific activities are commonly identified as particularly valuable, some activities find niche segments of students benefitting more than others.

The conclusion to be drawn is that “one size does not fit all” when it comes to the optimal combination of hidden learning activities. Each student appears to get a uniquely tailored combination of benefits from such activities. Aside from the few that are of great benefit to all, several of the additional activities may be particularly advantageous to a small number of students even as all others feel they did not benefit at all from the same activities.

Further, discussions easily yielded recommendations for enabling additional hidden learning activities expected to be of value. These were often of greater value to certain students more than others, but sometimes they were more widely endorsed. It appears students have not reached the limit to the number of hidden learning activities students can reasonably evaluate and choose among.

## Hidden Learning Activities Contribute in Unique and Complementary Fashion

There are a range of benefits that students perceived from the various hidden learning activities discussed. Encouragingly, these benefits each tended to relate to at least one of the Four Foci of Holistic Learning, suggesting that the activities are contributing to holistic learning.

In reviewing the activities, this report will highlight these linkages for each of the various activities examined.

## PERCEIVED HIERARCHY OF VALUE OF HIDDEN LEARNING ACTIVITIES

The figures below are sorted to provide an aggregate ranking of these activities based upon participants' perceived benefit of each type of activity. In some cases, the ranking is more arbitrary than others and that, coupled with the fact that this research was qualitative and not quantitative in nature, means that readers should not consider the ranking to be truly empirical.

In order to ease the examination of perceptions of all the various hidden learning activities discussed in the groups, the following colour-coded figures summarize the findings pertaining each individual activity. The colour coding reflects where each activity falls among four hierarchical categories depending upon the level of consensus around the value that each hidden learning activity is felt to provide. These hierarchical categories are:

### VALUED BY **ALL**

Figure 1: Experiential Learning Visits (ELVs)  
Figure 2: Casual, informal or spontaneous interactions  
Figure 3: Coffee and tea breaks; meals in the mess hall

### VALUED BY **MANY**

Figure 4: Organized sports (i.e., hockey, rugby, soccer, etc.)  
Figure 5: TGIT (Thursday night gathering)  
Figure 6: Lunch 'n' Learns

### VALUED BY **SOME**

Figure 7: Social clubs (i.e., scotch, wine tasting, yoga, etc.)  
Figure 8: Special events/outings (i.e., sporting, family, etc.)  
Figure 9: Digital/online tools (i.e., Facebook, apps, etc.)

### VALUED BY **FEW**

Figure 10: Conferences  
Figure 11: Outreach/Volunteer activities  
Figure 12: Group weekend travel "road runner" group

Each summary table includes the following results pertaining to each activity:

- **Average Ranking:** This is the mean ranking of participants' perceived value among the 12 potential hidden activities examined by all. Separate means are shown for Canadian JCSP, International JCSP and NSP students. The lower the number, the higher the ranking in terms of perceived value;
- **# Ranking Activity Top 3:** This is the actual number of participants who ranked this hidden learning activity among the three most valuable to them.
- **Learning Foci Aided:** This is a checklist that highlights which learning foci, if any, are being aided by that particular hidden learning activity, based upon Earncliffe's interpretation of the discussions and understanding of the foci.
- **Insights:** Observations and key findings relating to the specific activity.
- **In their own words:** These are quotes from participants relating to the specific activity.

Activities Valued by **ALL**

<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b> ✓ Learning to learn ✓ Learning the game ✓ Learning to be an expert ✓ Learning the profession
Canadian students	2.3	
International students	2.2	
NSP students	1.0	
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		
Canadian students	7 of 8	
International students	12 of 13	
NSP students	8 of 8	
<b>Insights</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>■ Almost all students ranked ELVs among their Top 3 (if not their top ranked), including a unanimous #1 ranking among NSP students.</li><li>■ Students argued this activity provided a uniquely powerful and invaluable in-person learning experience; to be able to directly ask questions of those who are working in that context as you experience it.</li><li>■ Many JCSP indicate these experiences are irreplaceable for truly understanding each field of service, while the NSP describe the experiences of being able to talk with some of the world's more revered experts as equally irreplaceable.</li><li>■ The opportunity to distance oneself from CFC also provided an ancillary benefit to those who lived with family in Toronto because it allowed them to focus on the programme and learning without having to balance the pressures and demands from family at the same time.</li><li>■ Many JCSP felt classroom experiences (on ELVs) should ideally be replaced with onsite visits to local institutions/facilities.</li></ul>		
<b>In their own words (Canadian students)</b>		
<i>"The value of being in a LAV, in a ship, in a chinook is valuable and the best way to understand it is to be in them and experience them for yourself."</i>		
<i>"The first ELVs were really where you started to break down the barriers."</i>		
<i>"Once we got in his element in a submarine, he was able to roll off and start to tell us a lot more about that context and it was the same for all the services – army guys, air force guys."</i>		
<i>"The ELVs not only opens your eyes to the other services, they actually help you understand your own better."</i>		
<i>"We're at a stage in our careers where we're going to be working together more. We went out to Victoria and sailed on a ship. We went to Petawawa. It gives us the opportunity to get to know our new peer group."</i>		
<b>In their own words (International students)</b>		
<i>"Made it completely clear what Canada does and what we can learn from them."</i>		
<i>"The visit to Ottawa wasted a lot of time in hotel rooms instead of visiting."</i>		
<i>"Great, but there are sometimes divisions based on NATO/Non-NATO or Five Eyes/Non-Five Eyes."</i>		
<i>"Allows us to connect with people at our particular level."</i>		



*"Separates us from our family, so that makes life a little easier (for time management)."*

**In their own words (NSP students)**

*"How else are you ever going to get to spend 30 minutes with Colin Powell?"*

*"Outstanding speakers, venues, interaction and organizational reflection."*

<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b> ✓ Learning to learn ✓ Learning the game ✓ Learning to be an expert ✓ Learning the profession
Canadian students	3.3	
International students	3.4	
NSP students	3.4	
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		
Canadian students	5 of 8	
International students	5 of 13	
NSP students	4 of 8	

**Insights & Recommendations**

- Among the student-led hidden learning activities, this was clearly the most commonly regarded as valuable.
- All students found value in the casual interactions and many placed it among the three highest ranked activities.
- There is appreciation for DS inclusion in social interactions, although it was observed that DS engagement in these activities varies widely.
- Trust-building and developing an understanding of what each individual brings to the table appeared to fundamentally be the benefits that related to what students got out of the programme and helped them succeed.
- The enjoyment of the social interaction clearly made it an appealing aspect.
- Depending on their living situation, virtually all felt like they missed out on some of the causal, informal and spontaneous interactions. Those living with family off residence felt they sacrificed some of these desired interactions due to family obligations. Road runners assumed they were missing out on valuable causal weekend interactions. Those living in residence described having a much smaller pool of colleagues with whom to interact on weekends and some evenings. The fact that all felt they were missing out on valuable opportunities for casual interaction is itself evidence of the value of the interactions.
- Some felt there would be a benefit to more such interactions that included NSP students.

**In their own words (Canadian students)**

*"You might do a reading and not understand it so twenty minutes before a class you grab someone and say, 'Can you explain this to me? I didn't get it.'"*

*"The syllabus is one thing, but sitting down and talking to someone who works in the area and say, 'What the heck does this mean?'"*

**In their own words (International students)**

*"Teasing out what does your government think about this or that. Talking to profs about things you're curious about that aren't appropriate to waste class time on."*

*"Gets you a less stilted view of opinions and impressions than you get out of a more formal lecture/syndicate discussion where you may not say exactly what you think."*

*"If you have a better understanding of where someone is coming from and where they are at, then if we ever have to run operations together, we can do it more smoothly. These interactions allow us to ask questions that would be inappropriate or embarrassing to ask when you're in an operation together. These casual conversations allow you to learn how to be more understanding/sensitive to cultures you'll be working with."*

*"With my family here, there are pros and cons. I love them, but at times they are a little cumbersome because you're trying to balance everything."*

**In their own words (NSP students)**

*"What you learn is secondary to who you get to know and enabling that is more valuable than improving the classroom."*

<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b> ✖ Learning to learn ✓ Learning the game ✖ Learning to be an expert ✓ Learning the profession
Canadian students	3.9	
International students	5.3	
NSP students	3.3	
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		
Canadian students	4 of 8	
International students	4 of 13	
NSP students	5 of 8	

**Insights & Recommendations**

- Although there clearly is a sense that these mess hall interactions must be among the more beneficial of the hidden learning activities discussed, there was plenty of constructive criticism offered regarding barriers to taking better advantage of the opportunities.
- This is one of the few hidden learning activities that are common experiences easily shared by all students, regardless of living on, living off or being a road runner. As such, it provides some unique points of access and opportunities to explore matters as fully as one desires with information exchanged with people of the more helpful perspectives, interests and/or backgrounds.
- As a relatively relaxed atmosphere (certainly, compared to the syndicate meetings), they enable conversations among students that help with such aspects as interpreting class material, learning about the perspectives of different trades and developing personal networks.
- However, noise and time constraints conspire to limit the ability to have deep conversations or easily engage with multiple other students.
- The lack of structure is probably necessary for maintaining the relaxed setting, but if there is opportunity to spread out more, reduce crowd noise or lengthen the break, students may be better able to leverage the hidden learning opportunities.

**In their own words (Canadian students)**

*"Short, superficial conversations."*

*"At the mess, I found it loud and awkward to try to get into someone else's conversation."*

*"The more stuff we can do here outside of the formal classes – even lunches – the better."*

*"Very hard to carry on a conversation."*

**In their own words (International students)**

*"Learned more about CAF specifics."*



*"Relaxed opportunity among like-minded guys, talking about stuff."*

**In their own words (NSP students)**

*"Excellent social and networking activity."*

*"The coffee breaks are great for interacting with the mentors and academic staff, but not very good for interacting with JCSP. It's just too short to naturally develop a conversation with someone who wants to ask you about what THEY are learning while you are thinking about the topic you just covered and you want to talk to another NSP student or a mentor or academic staff about what YOU are learning."*

## Activities Valued by **MANY**

**Figure 4: Organized sports (i.e., hockey, rugby, soccer, etc.)**

Average Ranking		Learning Foci Aided
Canadian students	7.7	
International students	3.3	✓ Learning the game
NSP students	6.5	✗ Learning to be an expert
# Ranking Activity Top 3		✗ Learning the profession
Canadian students	1 of 8	
International students	1 of 13	
NSP students	0 of 8	

**Insights & Recommendations**

- The topic of organized sports was somewhat polarizing in terms of how beneficial it was as a hidden learning opportunity.
- In general, these interactions seemed to be more valued by the international students than the Canadian students. This may have been due to the sports – particularly hockey – being more of a novelty to the international students than to Canadians.
- Having said that, when asked to describe the hidden learning benefit of organized sports, JCSP students suggested they were beneficial for providing another way to make connections, build relationships and strengthen a network.
- None of the NSP students mentioned it in conversation, but one indicated on the handout that they had taken advantage of the option.

**In their own words (Canadian students)**

*"There's also learning in terms of learning a new sport like cricket."*

*"I put sports and social lowest because when you're doing sports, you're too focussed on the sport instead of learning."*

*"These opportunities often were the ones we tapped to have a continued conversation about what you covered in the syndicate."*

**In their own words (International students)**

*"It enabled the spontaneous/casual conversations that were so valuable."*

*"Experiencing cricket was also an opportunity to learn more about another culture."*

*"Sports is a great way to build relations."*

*"Scheduling sometimes conflicted – soccer and hockey for example. I wanted to try hockey, but I love*

soccer.”

*“Sport helped escape the boredom of Ralston.”*

**In their own words (NSP students)**

*“An opportunity to decompress.”*

**Figure 5: TGIT**

<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b> ✓ Learning to learn ✓ Learning the game ✗ Learning to be an expert ✓ Learning the profession
Canadian students	5.8	
International students	5.2	
NSP students	4.8	
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		
Canadian students	1 of 8	
International students	1 of 13	
NSP students	3 of 8	

**Insights & Recommendations**

- TGITs are particularly appreciated among those who take advantage of them.
- Attendance ranged fairly widely, largely as an artifact of living off residence and/or having families who need and deserve attention.
- As with experiences at the mess hall during the course of the regular “school day,” the fact that it was a relaxed atmosphere more designed to be social was what enabled discussions and networking that were beneficial and enjoyable.
- There is some division of opinion over the role that alcohol plays and it appears some wonder whether TGITs lean more towards being a bit too hard a party for one to do very often at this stage in life.
- The activity is felt to be valuable, but it is unclear whether any effort to encourage more tempered behaviour – even periodically – would be a net gain on the hidden learning value.

**In their own words (Canadian students)**

*“TGIT is where you learn the traditions of the other services. You can read about it all the time but when you live it, it is way different.”*

*“The very relaxed, informal, nature of TGITs allow people to get to know each other and therefore when someone offers their opinion, you value it more.”*

*“The more stuff we can do here outside of the formal classes, the better. However, with the family, there was no way I could attend every TGIT.”*

*“This was beneficial to develop informal relationships.”*

**In their own words (International students)**

*“It’s not only about alcohol consumption, it’s a good space and time to talk about topics you wouldn’t normally raise in the sessions. However, it’s not really good for those who have families in town.”*

*“I had the opportunity to make new friends.”*

*“I did not learn much in a traditional sense, but was good for socializing and that helps.”*

**In their own words (NSP students)**

*“Best way to socialize outside of class.”*

*“I go sometimes but it is still kind of segregated. You hang in your group.”*

**Figure 6: Lunch 'n' Learns**

Average Ranking		Learning Foci Aided ✓ Learning to learn ✓ Learning the game ✓ Learning to be an expert ✓ Learning the profession
Canadian students	6.3	
International students	8.3	
NSP students	8.2	
# Ranking Activity Top 3		
Canadian students	2 of 8	
International students	2 of 13	
NSP students	0 of 8	

**Insights & Recommendations**

- While there were two in each JCSP group who considered the lunch 'n' learns to be among the most valuable of the hidden learning activities discussed, the broader consensus among JCSP students appears to be that there is much potential benefit left unrealized.
- The assumption among the students was that a lunch 'n' learn was really about hearing from a distinguished individual or expert from outside the JCSP who is on campus, either as an NSP participant or a guest speaker on campus. They saw other hidden learning activities (e.g., social clubs, casual conversations, etc.) as the sort where student-to-student dialog was more valuable.
- NSP students felt quite differently with none mentioning lunch 'n' learns as particularly beneficial for them.
- JCSP students indicated that the organization of lunch 'n' learns was left to students themselves and that appears to have resulted in some wasted opportunity. For example, the opportunity to "pick the brains" of VIPs who are on campus is considered so valuable that leaving it should not strictly be left to students to organize, since that has resulted in inconsistent experiences.
- It is possible that some advance knowledge of speakers coming to campus and an introduction to enable an invitation to lunch might result in more successful attempts at lunch 'n' learns.

**In their own words (Canadian students)**

*"The lunch 'n' learns are a great concept, but they did them horribly. The NSPs are supposed to teach us things we should know they never got. It was poorly organized and left to us to organize. There's no reason why we can't get a 40-minute brief from each of them over the year; especially the civilians."*

*"Picking the brain of a guest for an hour over lunch, with a small group of five, is a fantastic opportunity to learn."*

**In their own words (International students)**

*No comments offered.*

**In their own words (NSP students)**

*"The fireside chats with the JCSP were better."*

Activities Valued by **SOME**

Figure 7: Social clubs (i.e., scotch club, wine tasting club, running club, yoga club, etc.)			
<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b>	
Canadian students	6.5	✗	Learning to learn
International students	7.3	✓	Learning the game
NSP students	6.7	✗	Learning to be an expert
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		✓	Learning the profession
Canadian students	1 of 8		
International students	1 of 13		
NSP students	0 of 8		
<b>Insights &amp; Recommendations</b>			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The social clubs were not as widely exploited as several of the other types of interactions investigated in the focus groups and the fact that there were a variety of them meant that they created smaller, more intimate groups.</li> <li>The smaller group setting with no requirement to focus on complex activity (such as a sport) appears to be creating an atmosphere quite conducive to the kinds of conversations that enable stronger bonding and more valuable exchanges of insights and observations.</li> <li>The like-mindedness of the gathering was recognized as something that helps remove barriers to developing valuable connections and trusting relationships that create a valued peer group and network.</li> </ul>			
<b>In their own words (Canadian students)</b>			
<i>"Make new friends; expand networking."</i>			
<i>"So much stuff can be done more easily if you know who to pick up the phone and call to get the answer. These kinds of groups forged those relationships."</i>			
<i>"A lot of those social events revolve around alcohol."</i>			
<b>In their own words (International students)</b>			
<i>"Relaxed opportunity among like-minded guys talking about stuff."</i>			
<b>In their own words (NSP students)</b>			
<i>No comments offered and the majority put "not applicable" when ranking activities.</i>			

Figure 8: Special events and outings (i.e., sporting events, family events, etc.)			
<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b>	
Canadian students	7.0	✗	Learning to learn
International students	5.0	✓	Learning the game
NSP students	4.9	✗	Learning to be an expert
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		✗	Learning the profession
Canadian students	1 of 8		
International students	1 of 13		
NSP students	4 of 8		
<b>Insights &amp; Recommendations</b>			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Although JCSP students tended to place greater value on several other types of activities that more directly contributed to their own experience, there was fairly widespread appreciation for the role</li> </ul>			

that special events and outings play.

- While the personal learning about cultures (particularly during 'international day') and additional bonding opportunities are recognized by the JCSP students as valuable, it seems the greater benefit is the inclusion of families.
- The ability to share some enjoyable experiences with the family is certainly a delight for many of the JCSP students, but more strategically, many students were able to describe how the family events relieve some of the pressure of parenting and of ensuring the family is getting as much as they deserve out of the experience of being in Toronto. The more that pressure is relieved, the more the student can focus on the learning and getting the most out of what the programme has on offer.
- Constructively, it may be worth considering how family events might be improved to be more appropriate for a wider range of ages.
- A few NSP students were more inclined to describe special events and outings as particularly beneficial, providing an opportunity to meet with people outside of the relatively small universe of NSP students.

#### **In their own words (Canadian students)**

*"Valuable because they were smaller groups and therefore you're more able to have a good conversation."*

*"There is a monotony of living on-campus that we need to break up (with outings)."*

*"International day is phenomenal! I tried to get my kids engaged with kids of the international students. It helps all of us better understand different cultures and break down stereotypes and develop a better understanding of each other."*

*"There's help across syndicates for weekend events. If one syndicate needs two people to help out with an event, a couple of us living in residence might step up and volunteer so people from that syndicate who need to go home can go home."*

#### **In their own words (International students)**

*"Because I can enjoy the Canadian culture with my family."*

*"Learning about culture, food, dress... and, not only for people in the college, but opening it up to people who aren't in it like families was great."*

*"All the special events we hosted – Halloween, Easter – were great for families."*

#### **In their own words (NSP students)**

*"Sponsor families were very helpful (and pro-active)."*

**Figure 9: Digital/Online tools (i.e., Facebook group, applications, etc.)**

<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b> ✓ Learning to learn ✓ Learning the game ✓ Learning to be an expert ✗ Learning the profession
Canadian students	8.8	
International students	6.6	
NSP students	7.2	
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		
Canadian students	0 of 8	
International students	0 of 13	
NSP students	0 of 8	
<b>Insights &amp; Recommendations</b>		



- Digital tools are widely considered by JCSP students to be underutilized and while some get great use out of one tool or another, many felt the use itself could be more valuable as a hidden learning activity than their experiences had been.
- Two applications were mentioned more often than any other: Facebook and WhatsApp.
- WhatsApp is a text messaging application that was useful for enabling contact/communication outside of structured curriculum (i.e., social interaction, arranging spontaneous activities, etc.) and appeared to be largely casual and non-academic. Opinions were mixed about whether it was particularly helpful for learning with a few critics seeing it as merely entertaining.
- Facebook was used by fewer and in a very different way than WhatsApp. Those who used Facebook placed value on the ability to share articles, comments about readings or about current events and to organize events or outings. However, there are many ways that Facebook can be exploited and it was not clear whether those who “used Facebook” were all participating in the same kinds of fora. Some clearly were in a student-created Facebook group, while it sounded like a few others may have merely connected with each other on Facebook individually. Awareness of the Facebook group was definitely not universal and those who were unaware or only became aware late in the year tended to regret not knowing about it.
- If the programme is leaving the adoption and exploitation of digital or online tools as a sort of informal/unspoken test of students, then the current approach is probably shedding some light on the resourcefulness, strategic thinking and collaborative skills of students.
- If the programme wants to leverage hidden learning activities to have the greatest net benefit for the greatest number of students possible, then there are a few simple things that can be done that would inspire students to create online communities and exchanges that are much more consistently valuable:
  - From the outset, set up a Facebook group which each student is welcome to choose to join/use or not, which would not be monitored by CFC and the only content posted or exchanged there would be posted by students.
  - Likewise, set up a secure LinkedIn group (which tends to be more about professional than social) that allows the formal creation of an ongoing peer group for the class, perhaps with the ability to connect with DSs, academics and past alumni to further expand the network and create a community that can be accessed and leveraged.
- Going forward, the programme’s approach to digital tools will almost certainly benefit from evolving thinking. Every cohort arriving at the programme will only be more and more used to modern applications and the constantly emerging features and capabilities. The technology and behaviours are evolving rapidly and the more that the programme keeps abreast of these changes, the better informed the programme will be as to the strategic value of taking one approach or another – whether more hands-off or providing some degree of direction.
- NSP students were less pre-occupied with untapped opportunity that digital tools may offer.

#### **In their own words (Canadian students)**

*“The sharing of articles and suggested additional readings were helpful. The social portion was not. You needed to sift through a lot to get to the nuggets.”*

*“What would be helpful is a LinkedIn group organized by this school that isn’t treated as a social tool like WhatsApp or Facebook.”*

*“We have a Facebook page that people will point to and spark discussion. For example, the art has been posted and there is quite a discussion about that.”*

*“Living off campus I didn’t even find out about the Facebook page until March.”*

**In their own words (International students)**

*"I had it as my number 2 but the college does nothing to help us with that. It's all student-driven and it was helpful particularly for information sharing, asking embarrassing questions and organizing things to do together."*

*"The WhatsApp was a great way to chat, make jokes and get to know a few things."*

**In their own words (NSP students)**

*"Used during ELV only."*

**Activities Valued by FEW**

<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b> ✓ Learning to learn ✓ Learning the game ✗ Learning to be an expert ✗ Learning the profession
Canadian students	6.3	
International students	6.3	
NSP students	7.0	
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		
Canadian students	0 of 8	
International students	0 of 13	
NSP students	1 of 8	
<b>Insights &amp; Recommendations</b>		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Discussions and written comments suggested that the only conferences that were attended were among the volunteer activity options and few picked an option that comprised of a conference.</li><li>If the programme does include sending all students to conferences, it may be that there is a difference in understanding of what a conference is and if that is the case, this study may not be adequately investigating that particular activity.</li><li>The very small number who attended a conference felt that it provided a rare opportunity to gain insight into the challenges being faced by the non-military world and observe how others go about discussing and addressing their respective challenges. This enables some ability to compare and contrast approaches as well as place the activities of the military within the broader societal context.</li></ul>		
<b>In their own words (Canadian students)</b>		
<i>"We had some?"</i>		
<i>"A couple of students did conferences (as a volunteer activity). The one I went to helped me understand that the problems we are facing are not really unique. The private sector faces the same things. I learned about what others are doing and points of contact. We'll be doing something about it in a few weeks and now I know some people who I will be emailing to help with that upcoming topic."</i>		
<b>In their own words (International students)</b>		
<i>No comments offered and the majority put "not applicable" when ranking activities.</i>		
<b>In their own words (NSP students)</b>		
<i>"Few at college. Minimal participation."</i>		



<b>Average Ranking</b>		<b>Learning Foci Aided</b>	
Canadian students	7.8	✓	Learning to learn
International students	8.4	✓	Learning the game
NSP students	9.6	✗	Learning to be an expert
<b># Ranking Activity Top 3</b>		✗	Learning the profession
Canadian students	0 of 8		
International students	0 of 13		
NSP students	0 of 8		
<b>Insights &amp; Recommendations</b>			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Discussions about the outreach/volunteer activities generated some rather paradoxical findings.</li> <li>The more passionate opinions tended to be negative with students describing this element of the programme as unnecessary, uninteresting, in some cases demeaning, a distraction from the tasks the students faced and even to some, insulting to be ordered to take this on at this point in their career (arguing that this type of activity has long been instilled in them).</li> <li>However, probing more deeply found that some students valued their experiences – usually because it exposed them to thinking and segments of society that were quite different from their usual circles and enlightening in one way or another. Further, even many of those who indicated a general negativity towards this requirement were then able to acknowledge sharing some of those positive benefits as a result of one activity or another they had taken on to satisfy this requirement.</li> <li>Clearly, there was learning occurring for many or even most and the programme may wish to consider whether positioning the volunteer/outreach requirement differently would yield a net improvement in the quality of the hidden learning experiences or at least in the student recognition of the value of the experience. For example, acknowledging that this may feel like an unnecessary distraction or some dues that each student has already paid in full by this point in their career, but there is a strategic reason why the programme tasks you with this now. It's good community relations, but there is an intended benefit to the students and it is perhaps up to the students to figure that out as part of their experience in the programme. Such messaging may avoid the negative framing and open some minds that are otherwise less receptive to learning from the experience than may be desirable.</li> <li>Not really applicable to NSP.</li> </ul>			
<b>In their own words (Canadian students)</b>			
<i>"We're required to do a bunch of outreach activities. I did three. A lot of those, you're talking to business people and having to politic, make connections, educate civilians, so you're thrown into a different situation."</i>			
<i>"I had a better experience with mine. I met with kids in Toronto who don't get a lot of chance to interact with people in the Forces. I learned that people have very little understanding of the Forces which was pretty helpful."</i>			
<i>"At this point in my career, I don't want to be told this is something I have to do. I already do it a lot."</i>			
<i>"The exposure to the diverse cultures that are here in Toronto is so very different from what you get on bases that are usually so homogenous."</i>			
<b>In their own words (International students)</b>			
<i>No comments offered.</i>			

**In their own words (NSP students)***No comments offered.***Average Ranking**

Canadian students	7.5
International students	9.0
NSP students	6.0

**Learning Foci Aided**

- ✖ Learning to learn
- ✖ Learning the game
- ✖ Learning to be an expert
- ✖ Learning the profession

**# Ranking Activity Top 3**

Canadian students	0 of 8
International students	0 of 13
NSP students	1 of 8

**Insights & Recommendations**

- The universe of JCSP students has many divisions, but perhaps the most significant in terms of the effect on hidden learnings is the three segments that form based upon living arrangements: living on; living off; and road runners. Regardless of their living arrangement, all are able to identify how it handicaps in one way or another and are universally able to see a benefit to one or the other of the other arrangements.
- Those living on campus indicate some forced loss every Friday as many fellow students abandon them and limit their ability to interact and the pool of potential people with whom to interact.
- Those living off campus indicate some disappointment at missing out on some evening hidden learning opportunities such as TGITs as they deal with lengthy commutes and/or the need to divert some attention away from the programme and towards their families.
- Those who are road runners indicate a sense of loss at missing out on what goes on at Ralston, or in Toronto, on the weekend and the ability to spend more time having the kinds of casual or informal conversations that living on campus would enable.
- It is plausible that the act of traveling on the weekends is not necessarily being used for interaction. Perhaps this is due to a need to take the time to read, decompress, enjoy private time, or a limited sense of connection between those taking the trip together. While one or two indicated hidden learning interaction was occurring during these trips, the conversations seemed to suggest many road running students were not exploiting this opportunity to a significant degree.
- NSP students who were “road runners” appeared to be more inclined to describe the travel as a valuable opportunity to interact with fellow NSP students. It is plausible that the smaller community that is NSP may more easily cultivate a level of familiarity that leads to easier conversation during the “down time” that is travel.

**In their own words (Canadian students)**

*“The opportunities to go home are not equal. I can see bitterness. Why do we focus on all the road runners – starting early and working late to get things done so road runners can get home early?”*

*“By living out, I feel like I’m missing out on a lot of things.”*

*“Living as a road runner has all kinds of impacts on how you can study, when you can study, you simply can’t do everything. It forces my spouse to be a lot more of a single parent from Sunday night to Friday evening.”*

*“You walk in on a Monday morning and those living in residence have already talked about a subject so they are not necessarily interested.”*

<b>In their own words (International students)</b> <i>No comments offered.</i>
<b>In their own words (NSP students)</b> <i>"Further network building."</i>

## ADDITIONAL FINDINGS

### Miscellaneous Hidden Learning Observations and Suggestions

In each group discussion, there were participants who volunteered personal observations which were not necessarily noteworthy to, or shared by, others. These elements were not probed in all groups, so it is plausible that raising them in other discussions would have demonstrated they are of value to more students than is otherwise implied by this limited volume of commentary.

These additional elements provide additional evidence that students are tailoring experiences in ways that provide them with a bespoke professional development process. These additional facets included:

- Playing in the band was cited by two students (one JCSP, one NSP) who felt it was not specifically a club, but it provided a similar opportunity for bonding.
- The 360 feedback was mentioned by one JCSP student as being extremely beneficial for assessing and developing leadership abilities/focus, although the student felt it was outside of the curriculum and therefore an additional learning activity that may be considered hidden.
- Any opportunity to host a visiting expert for lunch, as one student noted? "to pick their brains about things that may not be about the lecture" are valued and there is a sense there can and should be more of them, including hosting those enrolled in the NSP programme.
- The different personalities of the DSs may be considered a "hidden learning" component since their different approaches make a difference. It was mentioned that one of the international DSs would discuss the difference of his cultural background after a lecture. These discussions were not part of the curriculum, but his students found these discussions interesting and helpful.
- NSP students mentioned "Whiskey Wednesdays" as valuable social and networking opportunities.
- One NSP student mentioned that there appears to be no expectation or opportunity to revisit the goal document each student was required to provide in advance of the programme and felt it would be valuable to review and discuss it with a senior mentor.

Prior to beginning the programme, several students independently gathered their own intelligence to help them prepare and improve their chances at success by calling on colleagues who had been through the programme; asking them for tips and advice. This not only indicates another source of hidden learning that is taking place in advance of attending, but the kinds of intelligence gathered demonstrates further forms of valuable information exchanges that are occurring. The information they gleaned from these conversations included:

- Expectations for the course work and load;
- Advice to do the course in-person versus online;
- Guidance to limit family trips in Roto 2 given the demand of the Roto; and,

- Guidance about organizing syndicate work and making use of technology (i.e., iPad and dropbox).

## Considerations Unique to International Students

International students are a unique and vital segment of the student population. Obviously, they receive a benefit by participating in the programme and it is perhaps more readily assumed that one of the benefits they uniquely receive is a deeper understanding of the Canadian military and society. However, what may be less immediately recognized is the value that Canadian students receive in the ability to interact with students from a variety of nations.

The discussions among Canadian students made it abundantly clear there is widespread value for the hidden learnings that come from getting to know their international counterparts more personally and developing an understanding of the range of perspectives across different national forces. Therefore, the considerations relating to the international students have both a direct relationship to their own programme experience and an indirect relationship to the interchanges that Canadians students value.

While some of the findings relating to the unique circumstances of international students revolved around the challenge of succeeding in the programme – most particularly, keeping pace with the readings when in a language that is not your own – there are three aspects that arose that do relate to hidden learning experiences:

1. An informal support group of “international wives” was formed and had a dual benefit to the international students. First, it meant their families were better supported, experiencing less stress and getting more out of their year in Toronto and that was an appreciated benefit. Second, the more that families were supported and events arranged, the more time and energy the student could devote to the programme, whether in terms of coping with the academic burden or engaging in the extra-curricular hidden learning activities such as organized sports, TGITs or other casual/spontaneous interactions. The inclusion of international students in those activities benefitted the Canadians as well, meaning there is a multiple “payoff” from such family support.
2. The period of time that is pre-programme, during which the international students arrive and gather for orientation is a valuable element, both for helping the international students get acquainted with the programme and facilities, and for launching the beginning of hidden learning engagements. Networks begin to form and a unique bond is developed within the international student community prior to the arrival of the Canadians.
3. Some international JCSP students raised the topic of sponsors and the ensuing discussion tended to demonstrate that few, if any, are benefitting from being paired with a sponsor. One explicitly indicated having unsuccessfully made an effort to leverage their sponsor. The discussion indicated there may be some lack of understanding over what the purpose of a sponsor is and questions over the selection of the sponsors and their motivation for being a sponsor. Fundamentally, the expectation is that a sponsor would be engaged in helping the international student in some way – whether in terms of finding accommodation, learning about Toronto or Canadian culture, or organizing events such as outings or dinner – and few seem to be experiencing this. Were the

sponsor to be more engaged, the interactions themselves would be hidden learning opportunities and it is plausible that as with the “international wives club,” some support could be provided that would allow the student to devote more time and energy to the programme.

## CONCLUSIONS

The research has clearly identified that hidden learning is definitely occurring in a wide variety of ways. It is providing added benefit to the professional development of the student both in terms of their academic success and in advancing their leadership and strategic thinking.

Students themselves are independently identifying the value received from hidden learning activities and all are taking advantage of some forms of hidden learning. Some students appear to be exploiting the opportunities to a greater extent than others. Different types of hidden learning activities would appear to relate in varying degrees to each of the Four Foci of Holistic Learning.

In discussing the experiences relating to the various forms of hidden learnings – whether from the prompted list or those activities that students mentioned on an unprompted basis – some common factors emerged that tend to lead to more valuable hidden learning experiences:

- the ability to experience things firsthand for themselves – whether trades, equipment or traditions;
- the ability to engage peers in their own trade, peers in other trades and peers with different international perspectives and converse with them on their own terms, allowing conversation to go wherever it is of greatest interest and value; and,
- the ability to form trusting relationships and safe environments in which to hold candid and frank discussions – with students, academics, DSs, experts or others – that may or may not relate to the curriculum.

In terms of how hidden learning is contributing to each of the four foci of holistic learning, students appear to receive benefits that contribute towards advancement along each of the four foci. The contribution from hidden learning activities do not appear to contribute to each foci equally. For example, almost all hidden learning activities investigated in the research would appear to be contributing to students learning the game, while few appear to directly relate to learning to be an expert.

Students also offered a wealth of constructive criticism for how future students may be able to gain even greater benefit from the various opportunities available, such as enabling the passing of advice and suggestions from one set of graduates to the next.

Depending on the strategic intent of the programme in leaving students to operate more independently of structure, direction, or stimulus provided programme staff, the findings from this study provide ample insights to consider whether and how hidden learnings may be more enabled or produce more consistently powerful impacts on professional development.

## REFERENCES

Eren, E., Butler, A., & Budgell, G. (2014). A Comprehensive Review and Analysis of Holistic Learning, Hidden Learning, the Hidden Curriculum, Leader Socialization, and the Curriculum Shadow. Ottawa, ON: Director General Military Personnel Research and Analysis.

Butler, A., Eren, E., & Budgell, G. (2015). Holistic Professional Learning in the Canadian Armed Forces: Research Proposal for Developing a Comprehensive Academic Model to Guide Strategic Leader Development. Ottawa, ON: Director General Military Personnel Research and Analysis.

Hachey, K. K. (2016). Holistic professional formation. Department of National Defence. Statement of Work.

Simons, M. V. (2009). Holistic Professional Military Development: Growing Strategic Artists. (Doctor of Education), Massey University, Palmerston North, NZ.



## APPENDIX A: INVITATION LETTER

*TO BE SENT VIA EMAIL*

Good day,

Following up on the advisory you received from your Programme Officer, I am writing to follow up with respect to your participation in a qualitative research study being undertaken by Earnscliffe on behalf of the Canadian Forces College and the Department of National Defence on Holistic Professional Formation. This research has been approved by the DGMPRA Social Science Research Review Board, in accordance with DAOD 5062-0 and 5062-1. The SSRRB approval number is 1648/17F.

This spring, we will be conducting a series of discussion groups with members of faculty/staff and students of the JCSP and NSP programmes. The intent of these discussions is to understand your views with respect to the programme and the relationship between formal, non-formal, and self-directed learning, as well as gain insight into your experiences in the JCSP and NSP programmes.

The discussion group would take approximately 2 hours of your time and would be held onsite at Canadian Forces College. The sessions will be moderated by myself, a fluently bilingual moderator, and therefore conducted in the language (English or French) of your choice.

You do not have to answer any questions that you do not wish to. As is customary with this type of research, results will be anonymous and reported on an aggregate basis only; at no time will any specific comments be attributed to you. All source documentation will be kept strictly confidential. Earnscliffe will prepare a written final report for the Department of National Defence. The report will be submitted in both official languages to Library and Archives Canada within six months of the completion of the focus groups. At the discretion of the Department, it will be shared with stakeholders across the Department of National Defence.

You are not compelled to participate in this research project. If you do choose to participate, you are free to withdraw at any time without prejudice. Similarly, if you choose not to participate, this information will also be maintained in confidence.

Those interested in participating are requested to complete the consent form (attached to this email) and send a response email with the signed form within two weeks to my assistant, Dorie Milito (cc'd here). Once all of the consent forms are received, we will liaise with CFC to determine a convenient time and location to conduct the focus groups. We will follow up with an email to all of those selected to participate confirming your participation.

If you require any further information, please do not hesitate to contact me directly (by phone at 613.563.4455 or by email at [stephanie@earnsccliffe.ca](mailto:stephanie@earnsccliffe.ca)).

Sincerely,  
Stephanie Constable  
Principal

## APPENDIX B: CONSENT FORM

### Qualitative Research: Holistic Professional Formation

#### Purpose of the Study

The purpose of the research is to understand your views with respect to the program and the relationship between formal, non-formal, and self-directed learning, as well as gain insight into the cultural values and assumptions that influence candidate learning in the JCSP and NSP courses.

#### SSRRB Approval Number

This research project has been approved by the DGMPRA Social Science Research Review Board, in accordance with DAOD 5062-0 and 5062-1. The SSRRB approval # is 1648/17F.

#### Participation

Your participation is completely voluntary and you have a choice at every stage to end your participation without reprisal or career repercussions. The discussion groups will be approximately 2 hours in duration. While you cannot remain anonymous within the focus group, the researcher(s) will ask other participants to keep discussions confidential. The researcher(s) will keep your responses confidential and will protect your anonymity in any reports or publications.

#### Risks

There may be risks involved in participating in this study, they are assessed as: LOW. Due to the nature of the research, your participation in this study will require that you volunteer or share personal experiences and information; but there is not anticipated risk or discomfort associated with the questions.

You are not required to respond to any question that you are not comfortable with and, should you choose not to respond, there will be no negative consequences for you.

#### Information You Provide

Information derived from any notes will be stored in a secure place. Any physical documentation is stored in a locked filing cabinet, locked in our offices at 46 Elgin Street in Ottawa, Ontario) Electronic documents are stored on a server located at the same address.

The information collected will be kept strictly confidential. No information that will directly identify you as an individual participant will be collected in the interview or stored with the dataset. While there is the remote possibility that someone might be able to deduce your identity based on some combination of the demographic questions, all individual level information will be kept strictly confidential. The only demographic information that we will be recording includes whether you are: 1) Canadian military, International military, or civilian; 2) attending JCSP or NSP; and, 3) identify as male or female. Only grouped information will be analyzed and discussed in reports and presentations. All source documentation (i.e., handouts, notes, etc.) will be kept strictly confidential and destroyed once our report is submitted and approved. We will prepare a written final report for the Department of National Defence. The final, approved, report will be submitted in both official languages to Library and Archives

Canada within six months of the completion of the focus groups. At the discretion of the Department, results will be shared with stakeholders across the Department of National Defence.

#### ATIP Considerations

The Access to Information Act and Privacy Act entitles Canadian citizens, permanent residents of Canada and individuals or corporations currently present in Canada to obtain copies of research reports and research information held in federal government files. Prior to releasing any information, the Director Access to Information and Privacy screens the information to ensure that the identities of individuals are not disclosed.

#### Questions/Concerns

Any information about your rights as a research participant may be addressed to Stephanie Constable by phone at 613.563.4455 or by email at [stephanie@earnscliffe.ca](mailto:stephanie@earnscliffe.ca).

#### What if You Change Your Mind About Participating?

You may withdraw from the study at any time without penalty – participation is completely voluntary. However, if you decide you no longer wish to take part after you have provided information we will not be able to remove the information from consideration as we are not collecting any personal information that would allow us to segregate your responses in the research study.

#### Acceptance

Your signature on this form indicates that you 1) understand to your satisfaction the information provided to you about your participation in this research project, and 2) agree to participate in this research.

In no way does this waive your legal rights nor release the researcher, sponsors, or involved institutions from their legal and professional responsibilities. You are free to withdraw from this research project at any time. You should feel free to ask for clarification or new information throughout your participation.

Name (please print)	Signature	Date
Participant:		
Principal Researcher:		

## APPENDIX C: QUALITATIVE DISCUSSION GUIDE

### English

#### INTRODUCTION

≈5 min

T=5 MIN

Welcome participants and explain the process:

Explain why they were selected and asked to participate.

The purpose of this interview is to obtain your feedback concerning your learning experiences during the JCSP/NSP programme. What we are most interested in is the learning that is not directly tied to the formally stated programme aims. We are interested in the learning that occurred outside of the formal programme: what you learned about yourself and about others through things like group activities, social events or informal exchanges with colleagues, staff or faculty. You are welcome to comment on the programme but our focus is on your personal and professional development during the year not on specific learning activities (e.g., lectures, syndicates). The information collected through this discussion will be used to help programme developers understand the informal learning that occurs around formal programme activities and ensure that all aspects of the programme help students become experts in their profession.

#### Moderator's role

- Lead the discussion and not necessarily expert
- Does not have a vested interest in the outcome of the session
- Remain neutral; however, may interrupt the conversation to clarify or ask additional questions

#### Participant's role

- Your open and honest opinion
- No right or wrong answers
- Do not have to all agree or reach a consensus
- Very important that you speak one at a time, everyone will have a chance to share their opinion

#### Standard focus group procedures

- Review consent form
- Session will be recorded (audio and video)
- Observers...
- Set phones to silent or vibrate, if necessary
- Length of the session will be no more than 2 hours

## WARM-UP

Σ=15 min

T=20 MIN

To start off, why don't we go around the table and introduce ourselves. I expect that you may already all know each other to some degree, but I don't know any of you, so please tell us your name and a little bit about the professional role you play.

## INFLUENCE OF BACKGROUND &amp; PAST EXPERIENCE

Σ=10 min

T=30 MIN

The focus of our discussion is going to be on the different ways in which people in general – and you in particular – may learn and develop professionally. The programme in which you have been participating uses common formal activities such as lectures, syndicate discussions and course papers but is also an immersive situation that involves interactions and experiences that occur outside of the official or supervised programming.

- Before you began your participation in this programme, what were your expectations of how you would be learning or the aspects of the experience that would be most valuable to you?
  - Did it end up being different from your expectations? If so, how?
- How do you think your own background and past professional development experiences impact what you get out of this programme?

## PERCEPTIONS OF LEARNING/TEACHING ELEMENTS

Σ=60 min

T=90 MIN

- What were the activities, exercises, approaches or experiences – whether within the programme or extracurricular – that you thought were most beneficial for you?
  - For each, what was it that made that particular learning activity so beneficial for you?
- And what were the ones that were least beneficial for you?
  - For each, what was it that made that particular learning activity so beneficial for you?
- Now, I'd like to go through some of the various ways you may have benefitted from this programme and for each, please tell me a bit about how valuable each was for your overall experience and why:
  - Lectures
  - Syndicate discussions
  - Experiential Learning Visits (ELVs)
  - Case studies
  - Activities and assignments
  - In-class collaborative exercises with other students
  - Collaborative assignments with other students that requires work outside of programmed/class time
  - Casual, informal or spontaneous interactions you have with other students that are extracurricular (have nothing to do with completing programme requirements)

- This programme has also provided you with a variety of types of interaction. Let's discuss some of these types of interactions and tell me a bit about whether or how each contributed to your learning and/or your overall experience:
  - Canadian students: probe for both in-class and outside of the programmed learning
  - International students: probe for both in-class and outside of the programmed learning
  - Instructors
- Thinking beyond the formal curriculum, what aspects of the programme do you feel led to the most valuable learning outcomes?
  - What was it that made that particularly valuable?
  - Along the same lines, are there things that could be changed that would make any of these more valuable?
    - Trips
    - Coffee & tea breaks
    - Seminars
    - Formal mess activities
    - Informal interactions at the mess
    - Sports activities
    - Other extracurricular social, casual or spontaneous interactions
  - What differences do you think there were for those who lived in residence as opposed to those who lived out?
  - What differences do you think there were for those who had family with them as opposed to those who didn't?
- What are your observations on assessments and the allocation of grades? Why do you say that?
- What are the major challenges or issues you experienced (or are experiencing) during this programme?
- If you could change any aspect of the programme, what would it be?
  - Probe for how work/life balance may be better enabled/achieved, timing (daily schedules, months of programme, etc.), accommodating visiting families, adding other experiences or enabling more of any type of experience.

SENSE OF PERSONAL PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Q=20 min

T=110 MIN

I'd like to spend a few minutes hearing whether or not – or how – this programme has changed your thinking about your own professional path and future.



- Did the programme help you understand what it means to be a strategic leader? If so, how?
  - Which aspects of the experience were most valuable for advancing your understanding of strategic leadership and how to develop as a strategic leader?  
(Probe for both programme elements and extracurricular experiences/learning)
- Did the programme help you understand what it means to be an operational leader? If so, how?
  - Which aspects of the experience was most valuable for advancing your understanding of operational leadership and how to develop as an operational leader?  
(Probe for both programme elements and extracurricular experiences/learning)
- Did the programme help you obtain professional mastery? If so, how?
  - Which aspects of the experience was most valuable for advancing your professional mastery and how to develop your professional mastery?  
(Probe for both programme elements and extracurricular experiences/learning)
- Did you learn anything that you were not expecting to learn or experience as a result of taking this programme? If so, what was that? (IF NECESSARY: And how was it that this programme taught you that?)
- Conversely, was there anything you were expecting to learn or experience which you did NOT learn or experience? If so, what was that? And how do you think it could have been incorporated?
- Other than what we've discussed already, did you learn anything about yourself through the experience of being in this programme? If so, what was that? (IF NECESSARY: And how was it that you came to learn this about yourself?)

#### WRAP-UP

⌚=10 min

T=120 MIN

**MODERATOR WILL SEE IF THERE ARE ANY ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS PRIOR TO CONCLUDING THE DISCUSSION.**

- Thinking of all the aspects we have discussed today, what do you think is the most important aspect to consider in order to make the learning experience as valuable as possible for those who participate?
- Is there anything else about your experiences with this programme that you would like to share?
- Is there any other piece of advice you would like to offer that may improve the learning experience for students in the future?

This concludes what we needed to cover today. We really appreciate you sharing your views. Your input is very important.

## APPENDIX D: HANDOUT

The purpose of our discussion is to gather your feedback regarding your learning experiences during the JCSP/NSP programme. What we are most interested in is the learning that occurred outside of the formal programme: what you learned through things like group activities, social events or informal exchanges with colleagues, staff or faculty.

Thinking about the various events, exchanges, activities, etc. in which you participated outside of the formal programme, please rank each in terms of how useful they were in terms of their contribution to your learning and overall experience in the programme AND in the space provided, please explain why.

	Coffee and tea breaks and/or meals in the mess hall
	Social clubs (i.e., scotch club, wine tasting club, running club, yoga club, etc.)
	Organized sports (i.e., hockey, rugby, soccer, etc.)
	Experiential Learning Visits (ELVs)
	Outreach/Volunteer activities
	Lunch 'n' Learns
	Conferences
	TGIT
	Digital/Online tools (i.e., Facebook group, applications, etc.)
	Special events and outings (i.e., sporting events, family events, etc.)
	Casual, informal or spontaneous interactions you had with colleagues, staff or faculty
	Group weekend travel "road runner" groups

Other (specify)

DOCUMENT CONTROL DATA		
(Security markings for the title, abstract and indexing annotation must be entered when the document is Classified or Designated)		
<b>1. ORIGINATOR</b> (The name and address of the organization preparing the document. Organizations for whom the document was prepared, e.g., Centre sponsoring a contractor's report, or tasking agency, are entered in Section 8.)  DRDC – Ottawa Research Centre Defence Research and Development Canada 3701 Carling Avenue Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0Z4 Canada		<b>2a. SECURITY MARKING</b> (Overall security marking of the document including special supplemental markings if applicable.)  <b>CAN UNCLASSIFIED</b>
		<b>2b. CONTROLLED GOODS</b>  <b>NON-CONTROLLED GOODS</b> <b>DMC A</b>
<b>3. TITLE</b> (The complete document title as indicated on the title page. Its classification should be indicated by the appropriate abbreviation (S, C or U) in parentheses after the title.)  <b>Holistic Professional Formation</b>		
<b>4. AUTHORS</b> (last name, followed by initials – ranks, titles, etc., not to be used)  <b>Earncliffe Strategy Group Inc</b>		
<b>5. DATE OF PUBLICATION</b> (Month and year of publication of document.)  <b>March 2018</b>	<b>6a. NO. OF PAGES</b> (Total containing information, including Annexes, Appendices, etc.)  <b>42</b>	<b>6b. NO. OF REFS</b> (Total cited in document.)  <b>3</b>
<b>7. DESCRIPTIVE NOTES</b> (The category of the document, e.g., technical report, technical note or memorandum. If appropriate, enter the type of report, e.g., interim, progress, summary, annual or final. Give the inclusive dates when a specific reporting period is covered.)  <b>Contract Report</b>		
<b>8. SPONSORING ACTIVITY</b> (The name of the department project office or laboratory sponsoring the research and development – include address)  DRDC – Ottawa Research Centre Defence Research and Development Canada 3701 Carling Avenue Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0Z4 Canada		
<b>9a. PROJECT OR GRANT NO.</b> (If appropriate, the applicable research and development project or grant number under which the document was written. Please specify whether project or grant.)  <b>04IC02-001</b>	<b>9b. CONTRACT NO.</b> (If appropriate, the applicable number under which the document was written.)	
<b>10a. ORIGINATOR'S DOCUMENT NUMBER</b> (The official document number by which the document is identified by the originating activity. This number must be unique to this document.)  <b>DRDC-RDDC-2018-C062</b>	<b>10b. OTHER DOCUMENT NO(s).</b> (Any other numbers which may be assigned this document either by the originator or by the sponsor.)	
<b>11a. FUTURE DISTRIBUTION</b> (Any limitations on further dissemination of the document, other than those imposed by security classification.)  <b>Further distribution done by approval from Author or equivalent Authority</b>		
<b>11b. FUTURE DISTRIBUTION OUTSIDE CANADA</b> (Any limitations on further dissemination of the document, other than those imposed by security classification.)  <b>DRDC Only</b>		

12. **ABSTRACT** (A brief and factual summary of the document. It may also appear elsewhere in the body of the document itself. It is highly desirable that the abstract of classified documents be unclassified. Each paragraph of the abstract shall begin with an indication of the security classification of the information in the paragraph (unless the document itself is unclassified) represented as (S), (C), (R), or (U). It is not necessary to include here abstracts in both official languages unless the text is bilingual.)

N/A

---

N/A

13. **KEYWORDS, DESCRIPTORS or IDENTIFIERS** (Technically meaningful terms or short phrases that characterize a document and could be helpful in cataloguing the document. They should be selected so that no security classification is required. Identifiers, such as equipment model designation, trade name, military project code name, geographic location may also be included. If possible keywords should be selected from a published thesaurus, e.g., Thesaurus of Engineering and Scientific Terms (TEST) and that thesaurus identified. If it is not possible to select indexing terms which are Unclassified, the classification of each should be indicated as with the title.)

Professional Military Education, Hidden Learning

## HOLISTIC PROFESSIONAL FORMATION: CONTRACT REPORT

Earnscliffe is pleased to present this report to the Department of National Defence summarizing the results of the qualitative research study to expand knowledge of the role of holistic learning at the Canadian Forces College (CFC).

As per section 10.2.3 of Standards for the Conduct of Government of Canada Public Opinion Research—Qualitative Research (<https://www.tpsgc-pwgsc.gc.ca/rop-por/rechqual-qualres-eng.html#s10.2>), it is important to note that qualitative research is a form of scientific, social, policy and public opinion research. Focus group research is not designed to help a group reach a consensus or to make decisions, but rather to elicit the full range of ideas, attitudes, experiences and opinions of a selected sample of participants on a defined topic. Because of the small numbers involved, the participants are not representative in a statistical sense of the larger population from which they are drawn and findings cannot reliably be generalized beyond their number.

Research Firm: Earnscliffe Strategy Group Inc. (Earnscliffe)  
Contract Number: W7714-176253/001/CY  
Contract award date: February 16, 2017  
Total contract value: \$40,081.10

I hereby certify as a Representative of Earnscliffe Strategy Group that the final deliverables fully comply with the Government of Canada political neutrality requirements outlined in the Communications Policy of the Government of Canada and Procedures for Planning and Contracting Public Opinion Research. Specifically, the deliverables do not include information on electoral voting intentions, political party preferences, standings with the electorate or ratings of the performance of a political party or its leaders.

Signed:

Date: March 4, 2018



Doug Anderson  
Principal, Earnscliffe  
46 Elgin St #200,  
Ottawa, ON K1P 5K6